

Teachers-in-Training Perception and Value of Academic Advising: The Nexus between Academic and Social Mobility.

*Joan Llewellyn
Graduate Student
Temple University
joanllewellyn@bmc.edu.jm*

Abstract: This is a qualitative study formulated on the pillars of Cognitive and Psychosocial theories outlining the perception and value ten teachers-in-training and four advisors at a teachers' college in Urban Jamaica have of academic advising and how this phenomenon affects advisees' performance.

This study seeks to understand how teachers-in-training and lecturers (advisees and advisors) construct pathways to maintain wholesome relationships to improve academic output and social development. The primary source of data was unstructured and structured interviews with teachers-in-training and lecturers. Additionally, other instruments were utilized such as observations during out of class meetings which included small group gatherings. Interview Transcriptions and field notes were included to provide rich descriptive notes of the phenomenon.

A period of two months was spent interacting and observing the participants in their natural environment. Data were prepared using triangulation matrices, data coding, and Constant Comparison Approach to generate categories showing patterns and relationships of meaning.

Keywords: Academic Advising, Advisee, Advisor, Perception

I. INTRODUCTION

The Jamaican educational landscape has changed significantly during the last ten years with more off-shore and private universities emerging and offering similar programs to those in government-owned teacher training colleges. This competitiveness has forced the Ministry of Education, Jamaica Teaching Council, University Council of Jamaica (Accrediting Agency) and college administrators to constantly review and improve the operational structure of public teacher training facilities. The components normally analyzed include but not limited to the recruitment process - qualifications of new entrants, program offerings and structure, credit hours, academic outputs, retention rates, electives, operational and structural goals of institution, as well as other factors influencing the output of graduates on a yearly basis. In light of the prevailing competition and harsh complaints from stakeholders about the rigor of teacher training (Tyson, 2011), the Ministry of Education agreed to a restructuring exercise which included (a) the transition from the diploma certificate to a bachelor degree which commenced September 2011. Consequently, all teachers-in-training accepted at that juncture will graduate with a bachelor degree in November 2015 and; (b) the introduction of an academic advising program to augment the quality of graduates exiting each institution annually.

In addition, to this restructuring exercise, the Ministry of Education decided to strengthen the pedagogical competence of in-service teachers who graduated at least five years ago with a

diploma certificate and had not acquired advanced training in newly established courses. Accordingly, in-service teachers were given the opportunity to upgrade at an institution of their choice for approximately one year and a semester. In 2012, a special task force (committee) was appointed by the Ministry of Education to examine the competence of in-service teachers and their impact on students' performance at the early childhood, elementary, high and tertiary levels. From the information garnered, a booklet entitled, "Vision 2030, Jamaica National Development Plan" was created and published underscoring the goals of the education system achievable by the year 2030.

Notwithstanding, diverse perspectives have been articulated in the printed and electronic media regarding the human resource and other educational objects needed to make this vision realistic. One of the common sentiments is that all graduates of teacher training colleges should possess the necessary social and academic capital to make the country a desired place to live, raise families and do business. To elevate this notion, it means that all stakeholders within the teacher training facility should coalesce for the cause of quality education. It therefore means, the academic advising program should comprise all the essential elements such as emotional intelligence, conflict resolution strategies, social etiquette and other refining tools to magnify the teachers-in-training full competence. Campbell and Nutt (2008) asserted that "When...done well, academic advising plays a critical role in connecting students with learning opportunities to foster and support their engagement, success, and the attainment of key learning outcomes" (p. 4). The challenge, as they see it, is to create an advising program that is viewed as important and essential by students, faculty, staff and administration. Brown (2002) believed that very often academic advisers fail to realize the magnitude of the power they hold (p.2).

Since 2012 most teachers' colleges without a robust mentorship program have embarked on academic advisement and have sought various ways to get the faculty members involved and trained to manage this task, ensuring that the yearly output meets global standards.

In a groundbreaking article, "Could Academic Advising Fix Higher Education", Hunter and White (2004) maintained that academic advising, well developed and appropriately accessed, is perhaps the only structured campus endeavor that can guarantee students sustained interaction with a caring and concerned adult who can help them shape such an experience (p. 21). Academic advising has long been considered an important yet often neglected part of academe. Crockett (1979) affirmed, "Academic advising, properly delivered, can be a powerful influence on students' growth and development. It can also interpret, enhance, and enrich the educational development of any college or university" (as cited in Titley & Titley, 1982, p. 46).

In 1990, Hossler and Bean stated that academic advising is the most often cited student service in terms of its positive impact on student persistence in the retention research. Tuttle (2000, p. 16) stated that retention is an important goal of academic advising. Research has confirmed that academic advising that connects the student to the institution as well as faculty; student contact can have a major impact on student motivation, involvement and retention.

Designing and implementing advising programs that will positively affect higher education's increasing diverse student population is an ongoing challenge. As examples of that diversity, Gordon and Habley (2000, pp. 73-83) report that eight out of ten students work while in college, 29% of first year students need some remediation in reading, writing, and math, 9% have some kind of documented disability, and as many as 10% are gay, lesbian, bisexual, or transsexual. According to Pasi Sahlberg, a Finnish educator and author, "The primary aim of education is to serve as an equalizing instrument for society" (New York Times, 2012).

Academic advising when appropriately administered can expand the college's reach, ensure a higher retention rate and improve the institution's image. According to O'Connell (2010) "Good developmental advising can teach important life skills to students and increase their chances of academic success. If you value student success and retention, you must value advising".

II. REVIEW OF LITERATURE

This literature review provides a solid foundation for comprehending how teachers-in-training and advisors perceive and attach value to the quality of the academic advising they receive and give. The researcher noted the gaps within the extant literature especially the limited information on the transferral of knowledge from academic advising to social life as well as the connection between home and school values. The literature incorporates a framework comprising six basic concepts necessary for generating and sustaining the relationship between advisor and advisee. The components include the integration of students' social/cultural capital with college values; advisor and advisee relationships; approaches to academic advising; academic advising models, student satisfaction and the transferral of knowledge to advance social and academic standards.

Integrating students' social/cultural capital with college values

Pierre Bourdieu & Jean-Claude Passeron conceptualized cultural capital in 1972 while attempting to understand the unequal scholastic achievement of children from different social classes (Bourdieu, 2001). Bourdieu (2001) explained that academic qualifications serve as a "certificate of cultural competence which confers on its holder a conventional, constant, legally guaranteed value with respect to culture" (p. 102). Oldfield (2007) explained cultural capital in higher education as "the knowledge, skills, education, and other advantages a person has that make the educational system a comfortable, familiar environment in which he or she can succeed easily." (p. 2).

Advisee-Advisor Relationships

The advisee-advisor relationship is a vital component in higher education (Luna & Cullen, 1998). The influence of a great advisor on a student can be life changing. A great advisor can instill the ethics, drive and skills to be both a great teacher and researcher. Conversely, a poor advisor can have adverse effects on his or her advisee's academic future and social life. The student has an opportunity to get to know their professional advisor over the course of several years, making it easier for the student to address concerns or ask any questions of their advisor. The faculty advisor

has many roles and responsibilities when it comes to advising students. "Advisors are expected to share their knowledge of major and degree requirements, help students schedule their courses, and generally facilitate progress to the degree in a timely manner" (Baker & Griffin, 2010, p. 2).

Approaches to academic advising

Burns Crookston is well known for developing the first two models of academic advising in 1972 which he differentiated as "prescriptive" and "developmental" (Hemwall & Trachte, 1999). According to Crookston, prescriptive advising can be best compared to that of a doctor/patient relationship. The student or "patient" has an ailment or problem and the advisor or "doctor" makes a diagnosis, prescribes something, or gives advice (Crookston, 1994). In contrast, the developmental model is "concerned not only with a specific personal or vocational decision but also with facilitating the student's rational processes, environmental and interpersonal interactions, behavioral awareness, and problem-solving, decision making, and evaluation skills" (Crookston, 1994, p. 15). Crookston believes that higher education and the advising process, as a result of the advisor and student engaging in a series of developmental tasks, can lead to students creating a plan for personal growth and self-fulfillment within their lives.

Student Satisfaction

The studies previously noted focused exclusively on student satisfaction with advising in relation to various academic advising delivery models, or in the case of Smith & Allen (2012) on the frequency of advising in relation to student satisfaction with advising and advising learning outcomes, or what has been termed in the literature as "quality academic advising." One significant research gap exists; an examination of academic advising delivery structures in relation to measures of student satisfaction with advising, student learning outcomes associated with advising and student retention. Miller (in press) posits examining advising delivery structures from an approach that involves (1) who is advised, (2) who advises, (3) where advising is done, and (4) how advising responsibilities are divided. Is there a relationship between these various academic advising delivery variables and student satisfaction with advising, academic advising learning outcomes, and student retention? In particular, how do these variables impact first-year students at our four-year public institutions; those at highest risk for attrition (ACT, 2010).

Prior research has shown student satisfaction to be a key factor in student retention, but little research has been done on academic advising related to how and where advising is delivered. Given the dramatic change in "who" delivers advising at our public institutions (Habley, 2004) it is essential that we know if "who" delivers advising has a relationship to student satisfaction with advising, student learning outcomes associated with advising, and ultimately to student retention. With this information, institutions can effectively and efficiently organize academic advising delivery models that have a better chance of contributing to student success.

Transferral of knowledge through self-efficacy

Self-efficacy is a social-cognitive concept that "refers to beliefs in one's capabilities to organize and execute the courses of action required to produce given attainments" (Bandura, 1997, p. 3). In this context, self-efficacy is manifested as students' belief in their abilities to succeed in college. The hypothesized model in the present study proposes that academic transfer student capital, including connections with faculty and engaging classroom experiences at the community college, predict academic adjustment at the university through self-efficacy/intent to persist. Self-efficacy/intent to persist in this study is a construct that measures both students' belief that they have the skills and abilities

necessary for success in college and their plans to graduate. Taking into account accumulated research on self-efficacy and academic outcomes, Bandura (1997) argued that perceived efficacy exerts a more substantial influence on academic performance [than skill development], both directly by affecting quality of thinking and good use of acquired cognitive skills and indirectly by heightening persistence in the search for solutions. (p. 216).

III. METHODOLOGY

Design

The researcher utilized a qualitative design, specifically, a phenomenological. This phenomenological design was selected to explore the lived experiences of teachers-in-training and advisors at this college regarding academic performance and social mobility which resulted from participation in academic advising. Phenomenological research uses the analysis of significant statement, the generation of meaning units and the development of what Moutsakes (1994) calls an essence description. A phenomenology, according to Merriam (2009), assumes that there is an “essence or essences to shared experience” and that “the task of the phenomenologist... is to depict the essence or basic structure of experience” (p. 25). Merriam (2009) postulated that a qualitative study focuses on gathering underlying meaning (p. 2). As such, the researcher relied upon the activities of “interviewing, observing, and analyzing” (Merriam, 2009, p. 2). Eisner (1998) posited that “Qualitative inquirers seek what Geertz (1973) has called “thick description.” (p. 35). The researcher has “aimed beneath manifest behavior to the meaning events had for those who experienced them.” (p. 35).

Sample

According to the College records (2014) the academic advising population involved 376 students and 55 lecturers; however, many did not participate although they were assigned advisors. The researcher’s initial intention was to have at least one advisee from each discipline across the various year groups but that proved rather challenging. This situation compelled the researcher to select a small subset of the entire population who cooperated with the program and researcher. It is believed that the selected subset of fourteen (14) was a reasonable benchmark for comparison and perhaps, the maturity necessary for objective reflection.

Participants selected for this study were first to fourth year students enrolled in the Bachelor of Education Program between September 2011 - September 2014 and possessed reasonable first-hand experience with academic advisement. All teachers-in training were deemed eligible because of their enrolment status, they are pursuing or have pursued programs in Early Childhood, Primary Education, Language Arts, Business Studies and History & Social Studies. Selected students experienced advising in the same geographic area with exposure to the same curriculum and similar methodology. The lecturers chosen advised at least one of the teachers-in-training and utilized the instructions mandated by the college. The researcher selected this format in order to observe the congruence between data collected from both advisors and advisees. This helped to reduce inequality where training and experience are concerned.

Sampling Technique

The researcher employed purposive sampling for this study. The greatest concern with purposeful sampling is that the results cannot be generalized to the entire population that is or was served by this college. Merriam (2009) supported the use of purposeful sampling, asserting that the participants’ experiences may be distinctive or unique. The researcher used those who were directly involved in academic advising. Castillo (2009) explained that purposive sampling is a more powerful way of gathering respondents for a project like this, stating

“Purposive sampling is used in cases where the specialty of an authority can select a more representative sample that can bring more accurate results than by using other probability sampling techniques. The process involves nothing but purposely handpicking individuals from the population based on the researcher’s knowledge and judgment” (para. 3).

Data collection

Data was acquired over a two-month period by means of unstructured and structured interviews with all participants. The unstructured interview was selected as the primary data collection tool as it afforded the researcher the opportunity to extend the conversations. Unlike the structured interviews, during the unstructured interviews, the researcher was able to reorganize the sequencing of questions based on the response from the participants. This effected the smooth transition of communicated and extracted meaningful data as considered appropriate. Kawasakiyee (2012) and Allen (2011) endorsed this sentiment by declaring that the unstructured or semi-structured interview has advantages over the structured interview, as the interviewer has control over the collection of data and the ability to allow the participant to veer from the pre-set questions if he/she feels that the participants, in expounding freely, may reveal desirable information or disclose depth of information that will allow for lucid understanding of the phenomenon.

Open-ended questions were used to provide an opportunity for participants to relax and freely associate their ideas with feelings, thoughts, and memories. It was felt that this approach would help the researcher to gain authentic contributions as the participants participated in constructing meaning about the phenomenon. Additionally, data from field notes, related literature and observations of groups and other social gatherings added to the thick and rich descriptive collection. Observations, field notes and related literature helped the researcher to better understand the phenomenon, making the interpretive process quite logical. All interviews were recorded using technology in a private space where member checks were undertaken to provide clarification and objectivity. Extensive field notes were taken during and immediately following the interviews. Data interpretation occurred simultaneously justifying what was recorded during the interviews and observations to develop an understanding of what was heard to confirm and/or disconfirm. Transcription of interviews ensued shortly after to avoid prejudice/bias and the researcher also rechecked with participants on gray areas to ensure misinterpretations were eliminated.

The researcher also utilized an electronic format to gather data from advisors due to time restrictions, especially among those who had tight schedules which did not allow for face to face interactions. In cases where the printed consent form was not provided, the researcher explained the purpose of the study and provided the participants an opportunity to withdraw at their own leisure. A matrix outlining the research questions with the following headings: what I need to know, why I need to know it and how I plan to obtain it, was also prepared to act as a relevant guide throughout the process. See Table below.

Table 1.0: Data Collection Tools

What do I need to know?	Why do I need to know it?	What kind of data will answer the questions?	Where can I find the data?	Whom do I contact for access?
How do teachers-in-training value the role of advisors in delivering an effective academic advising program?	To know how students feel about the role of advisors in academic advising	Interviews and Related Literature	College and Scholarly Articles	Vice Principal of Academics, Students and Library Personnel
How do college lecturers perceive their role in academic advising as impacting students' performance and social mobility?	To determine the impact of academic advising on students' social and academic performance	Interviews, Field- notes, Observations and Related Literature	College & Scholarly Articles	Vice Principal of Academics, Students and Library Personnel
What structure is in place to ensure accountability and sustainability of the program?	To assess the degree of value that is placed on the program to make it successful	College records Academic Reports, and Interviews	College, Interviews	Vice Principal of Academics and Interview Transcriptions
What are the indicators of success?	To identify the indicators of success and determine students' perception of effectiveness	Students' Scholastic Records, Interviews and Related Literature	College, Interviews and scholarly articles	Vice Principal of Academics, Interview Transcriptions and Library Personnel
What level of training is provided for advisors to adequately satisfy the needs of advisees?	To determine if lecturers possess the necessary skills required for their role as academic advisors	College Records and Interviews	College and interview instrument	Vice Principal of Academics and Interview Transcriptions
What other studies indicate links between performance and social mobility?	To evaluate the relationship between Academic performance and social mobility	Interviews, Observations and Literature	College, Interviews and Related Literature	Vice Principal of Academic Affairs, Students, Lecturers and Library Personnel

IV. DATA ANALYSIS

The researcher used the guidelines developed by Chiseri-Strater & Sunstein (1997) to help with the analysis of field notes, interview transcriptions and observations. Likewise, items from the Academic Advising Inventory were examined to assist with the development of the interview protocol instrument. Tables with the relevant themes were used to record behavior patterns of advisees and advisors, to understand the meaning and interpretation of the relationship as outlined in the literature and to compare data collected on third and fourth visits with interview transcriptions and observations. See table 1.1 for dominant themes.

Data Coding

The researcher relied on the participants' views of the situation to construct meaning. Meaning was constructed socially, that is, from the plural views of the fourteen participants. According to Creswell's (2013) treatment of the topic, the researcher extracted the following directives from discussion on the topic of social constructivism and used it as a guide, where it was applicable. The researcher sought patterns and emergent ideas in the following ways: a) looked for complexity of views as opposed to narrow categories to extract meaning; b) developed a consensus or pattern of meaning; (c) used open-ended questions during the interviews; (d) used the words of the participants, literature review and field notes to develop the analysis; (e) examined the cultural setting of participants; (f) anticipated the creation of a literary end-product; (g) disclosed any biases that other readers may think would make the researcher incapable of rendering an objective viewpoint about the findings and report what the participants' views were, without bias. (pp. 24-25).

Descriptive: The researcher read the transcriptions and looked for themes, commonly used phrases, and terms that showed congruence of ideas among those who were interviewed. These congruent ideas were aggregated to form categories.

Values: Values coding was employed to construct meaning from the themes. Saldana (2013) opined that values coding is appropriate for "all qualitative studies, but particularly for those that explore cultural values, identity, intrapersonal, and interpersonal participant experiences...and can be determined *a priori* (beforehand) as Provisional Codes, or constructed during coding of data" (p. 111). Values coding is the application of codes onto qualitative data that reflect a participant's values, attitudes, and beliefs, representing his or her perspectives or worldview" (p. 110). Values coding was performed on the interview transcriptions and field notes. This was done to determine whether there was similarity between the values, beliefs, and attitudes vocalized during the interviews and the inflections and attitudes observed by the researcher (Saldana, 2013).

In Vivo: These codes were taken directly from what the participants said and placed in quotation marks. The researcher used these to ensure that concepts remained as close as possible to participants own words during generation of field notes and interview transcriptions (Creswell, 2009).

Simultaneous: Simultaneous Coding applies two or more codes within a single datum. These emerged from field notes and interview transcriptions which helped the researcher with validity of data.

Table 1.1: Dominant Themes

Theme	Data Source 1	Data Source 2	Data Source 3
Uncertainty	Field notes 1	Field notes 2	Interview Transcriptions #s 2 - 7
Anxiety	Field notes 1	Field notes 2	Interview Transcriptions #s 3 - 7
'Time Management'	Field notes 1	Field notes 2	Interview Transcriptions #s 1 - 14
'Feedback'	Field notes 1	Field notes 2	Interview Transcriptions #s 1 - 6
Willingness	Field notes 1	Field notes 2	Interview Transcriptions #s 2 - 8
Commitment	Field notes 1	Field notes 2	Interview Transcriptions # 1 - 9
'Good Relationships'	Field notes 1	Field notes 2	Interview Transcriptions # 1- 14
'Motivation'	Field notes 1	Field notes 2	Interview Transcriptions # 1 - 14
Critical Thinking	-	-	Interview Transcriptions # 1 - 10
Networking	Field notes 1	Field notes 2	Interview Transcriptions # 1 - 10
'Positive Atmosphere'	Field notes 1	Field notes 2	Interview Transcriptions # 2 - 8
'Mentorship'	-	-	Interview Transcriptions #3- 4
'Structured Academic Advising'	-	-	Interview Transcriptions #s 1 – 14

Constant Comparison Approach (CCA). The researcher employed this approach during the manual pairing of similar experiences among participants. The researcher used the Constant Comparison Analysis (CCA) procedure in the analysis of all participant responses, individually and within focus groups. Codes were inductively applied to the groups of responses. Hence, the

greatest value of CCA emerged, “assuring that all data are systematically compared to all other data in the data set” (Fram, 2013, p.2). Strauss and Corbin’s (as cited in Fram, 2013) coding framework published in 1990 underscores the need to focus on the participant’s views and experiences and identify patterns as evidence of social processes in the experiences of the participants (p.6). The use of CCA as a data analysis tool allowed the researcher to accomplish that goal.

The researcher used a triangulation matrix to highlight the most dominant themes recurring in field notes and interview transcriptions. Data Source 1 represents the experiences shared and observed prior to the actual interviews; Data Source 2 represents the experiences collected and observed on the day of the interviews and Data Source 3 represents the shared experiences during the interview with each participant. Cross checks were consistently done to ensure the emerged themes in the Triangulation Matrix corresponded with the themes in the tables outlining field notes. Refer to table 1.1.

The utilization of the principles of the Constant Comparison Approach during the emergence of themes from the observations, field notes and transcription of interviews helped the researcher to recognize the validity in each conversation. Fram (2013) stated, “...the use of the Constant Comparison Approach commences with comparing incident to incident. But as it progresses, it is the increasingly abstract process of comparing concept to incident and concept to concept that further integrates coding... It is through the process of comparing concept to incident that the researcher can check to see if further incidents fit with the newly developed concepts and, in so doing, ensure that the concepts are capable of accounting for all related incidents in the data” (p. 3).

The Triangulation Matrix shows thirteen (13) themes which emerged from the shared experiences of all participants. These themes represented varying categories of data coding such as values, simultaneous, descriptive and in vivo which appeared in all the data collection tools. Interestingly, seven of the themes (more than half) reflected the in vivo coding pattern. They were the direct and repetitive pronouncements of the participants. Only three themes – critical thinking, mentorship and structured academic advising did not emerge in field notes 1 & 2 but featured prominently in the interview transcriptions.

There was congruence between the meanings extracted from the advisees and advisors transcriptions. The advisors indicated that they were able to sustain good relationships with their advisees through carefully maintaining a professional balance even during informal activities. Self-efficacy is a social-cognitive concept that “refers to beliefs in one’s capabilities to organize and execute the courses of action required to produce given attainments” (Bandura, 1997, p. 3).

The participants who displayed willingness to participate demanded feedback on the outcomes of the study which motivated them to give up several minutes of valuable learning time to share and benefit from this experience. All advisees credited the relationship they had with their advisors and declared that it engendered motivation especially during the difficult periods. Hollis (2009) believed ‘... the goal in advising is to create a relationship with the student so that the student is getting the most out of their education. The academic advisor for any student presumably holds the key to progress by coaching new and continuing students through general education choices, major selections, minors and possibly certificate options.

V. RESULTS & DISCUSSION

Research Questions:

1. How do teachers-in-training perceive and value the effects of academic advising on their academic and social mobility?

As mentioned earlier, the researcher used the Constant Comparison Approach to group the most prominent and repeated themes from advisees' data collection tools to form four major categories to respond to this research question: a) time management; b) good relationships; c) networking; d) motivation

Time management

All ten advisees reported that one of the major effects on their social and academic life was time and understanding how to use it prudently. Some agreed that they were able to plan their routines with special care in order to maximize their academic output while maintaining a social balance. Those who benefited mentioned that they were able to do so because of (a) their willingness to follow the instructions of their advisors and (b) reflecting on the negative experiences in first year which taught them how to appropriate and manage time effectively.

A fourth year confessed, "...in second year I was depressed by the number of course assignments I had to complete and did not know where or how to start, I contacted my advisor who instructed me to develop a timetable highlighting the courses and due dates, then work assiduously to meet those deadlines. I was able to reduce the stress and acquire good grades".

A third year stated, "...in my circumstance, advising was structured according to the advisor's schedule but students went collectively and individually outside of the designated hours. Whenever, I had an academic challenge, I sought the help of the advisor and if she were not available, I contacted others lecturers. That basically how I was able to deliver assignments on time and manage my life".

On the contrary, some participants perceived that the unstructured approach to advising affected their time management skills and created shortfalls in both the academic and social areas. A second year regrettably could not share a positive experience about the meetings had with the advisor as much time was not spent formalizing a relationship. This particular advisor had no set time to converse with the advisees and they were left on their own to fathom things for themselves. This sentiment was also endorsed by others.

Apparently, optimal performance in the social and academic spheres is closely aligned with students' satisfaction level. There is the tendency for increased performance when students feel the presence of advisors and according to Pamela (2009) "... it is clear that tertiary students need accessible and timely support from advisers, in an order to develop and perform at their optimal level". Chun-Mei, Z. (2007), 'two different and potentially important influences on student satisfaction with the student-advisor relationship is selecting the right advisor might be the most important act, or satisfaction with the relationship might depend more on specific advisor behaviors once the relationship is undertaken".

Good relationships

Good relations between advisors and advisees added a degree of self-worth for most advisees, who asserted that this element kept them going during the difficult times. A fourth year recalled, "... my advisor was helpful to a dimension as I was able to use the information to network and get along with internal and external personalities".

A third year conceded that the relationship with the advisor fostered a long term relationship. The advisor was referred to as 'mom' and such positive rapport enabled professional bonding and the will to discuss concerns academically and socially. Despite the positive outcomes experienced by some participants, others believed that many students did not benefit from good relationships due to the unstructured meeting pattern. A fourth year said, "I struggled with academic work in the first year as there were numerous conflicts between personal and college values. I had no guidance but practically did things how I thought best". This resulted in the failure of several courses and I had to attend summer school that was when I really woke up to reality of college responsibility. However, in the subsequent year, I found another advisor, not the one I was assigned to. He assumed the role of a 'father-figure' and that helped me to improve my academic output, significantly".

A third year said, "The relationship was good but I did not get much advising. The advisor felt I was a mature student who was capable of handling matters on my own. I only got advice during class sessions." Another stated that reliance on a relative, an alumna was helpful, as it was rather challenging to make the transition during first year. Petress (1996) cautioned that receiving quality academic advising needs to be sought after by both the advisor and the student in order for it to be a successful process and for the student to see the benefits of having an advisor.

Networking and Motivation

These two categories were closely interrelated as the impact on one affected the outcome of the other. These were accountable for capacity building in the academic and social spheres. The networks established with internal and external sources helped most advisees to engage in better planning techniques to enhance the output of their academic endeavors. Consequently, they became better users of the available resources. This also included effective use of their time to complete assignments and engage in social activities. Advisees believe networking is a fundamental skill which should be honed from this very level and shape continuously throughout the professional cycle. So much so that one advisee commented, "... group work entails networking as one individual cannot bear the burden. There is need for collaboration from this very early stage as when one becomes a teacher, he or she cannot sit in the staffroom to get work done by him or herself".

Two third years revealed that the motivation they have gotten from their advisors encouraged them to become good student leaders. One of them reflected on the numerous challenges with writing skills but the constructive feedback and 'sit down' time with the advisor paved the way for growth. This form of motivation inspired hope and willingness to reach out to others who struggled with the similar issues. Habley (2004) believed that 'who' delivers advising is critical in public institutions as there is a close relationship among student satisfaction, learning outcomes and retention (Retention was not featured in this study).

2. How do advisors value the outcomes of academic advising on students' academic performance and social life?

The four advisors interviewed shared varying experiences. Two were not able to describe the outcomes in tangible ways due to the following reasons: (a) advising was discontinued from as early as December 2012 and (b) advising occurred too randomly hence, it was difficult to validate the true outcomes. Nonetheless the experiences were grouped under two main categories: motivation and positive relationships.

Motivation

At this point it is significant to reflect on the cognitive and psychosocial theories undergirding this study. Cognitive development is viewed as sequential development which occurs when (an individual's) cognitive structure is changed, thus enabling new ways of incorporating experience (Creamer, 2000, p. 23). Because cognitive structures vary from one individual to another, individuals may have very different views of a single event (Creamer & Creamer, 1994). In this study, advisors analyzed development using divergent lens, however, what was common was their identification of movement in academic and social areas, however, minimal.

Advisor #1 noted that the interactions with advisees have resulted in them using the information to inform their daily operations or lifestyle and students' scholastic scores appreciated over the last two years. These outcomes and more provided an impetus to continue working with students.

Advisor #2 believed that the operational and structural organization of the system negatively affected the outcomes of the program but added, "... the students' level of maturity and responsibility wasn't always what was expected and so with their exposure to academic advising there were many areas of growth and development that was seen over time".

Positive Relationships

Advisor #3 emphasized that the positive professional relationships established with advisees had long lasting impact on their social mobility. It was mentioned that on their first meeting the classroom space was transformed into a social arena where finger food, drinks and games were incorporated. The advisor added that the atmosphere created a sense of belonging and understanding among all. Today, these students feel comfortable talking about any topic in and out of a formal setting.

Advisor #4 was unable to identify any specific academic or social outcome generated by academic advising. The advisors conceded that work related activities interfered with the quality of advising and little attention was paid to the social element. Although advisors believed they employed the developmental approach, the explanation in the related literature indicated such occurred on the periphery. Crookston (1994) suggested that the developmental model is "concerned not only with a specific personal or vocational decision but also with facilitating the student's rational processes, environmental and interpersonal interactions, behavioral awareness, and problem-solving, decision making and evaluation skills".

Understanding how students in a particular stage or level of development establish meaning in their lives can provide insights to advisors which allow them "to explain conditions in students' lives that are often confusing and that sometimes block effective planning and learning" (Creamer, 2000, p. 21).

3. How do students transfer the knowledge gained from academic advising to their social lifestyle?

The data collected from the advisees and advisors were grouped into two categories: (a) motivation; (b) critical thinking. All ten advisees reported that at different instances they were able to transfer the information to their social situations to avoid conflicts and maintain sanity throughout each academic year.

Motivation

A second year reflected on an encounter with a classmate during group work activity and was only able to restrain self due to the

information received in academic advising sessions. The advisee recounted the incident in this manner, 'I almost knocked him over when I heard the voice of my advisor saying, intelligent people are rationale thinkers and do not act immaturity'. The advisee continued to recall that it was at that moment when the message reverberated in the brain space that the limbs became numb and the next emotion was crying in private space.

A third year stated that encounters with verbal were normal on the hall of residence but was able to maintain composure because of good home culture and academic advising.

Another third year who benefitted significantly from academic advising, is relishing the idea of starting a mentorship club on campus to inspire young leaders who are struggling with various issues. Bean and Eaton (2000) explained that students will begin to perceive that they are in control of their academic and social destiny and be motivated to take action consistent with that perception. ... Thus, a student with a positive assessment of self-efficacy feels a sense of integration in the environment and returns to the environment to re-invest her/his success in the academic and social milieu of the higher-education environment (p. 58).

Critical Thinking

Most of the advisees confirmed that they acquired numerous skills in academic advising sessions, chief among them was critical thinking. They mentioned various ways they have been utilizing this skill:

A second year was able to help a youngster think outside of the box while on first year observation in 2014. The advisee spoke of a particular student who struggled with a math problem because he misconstrued the teacher's explanation. In an effort to relieve the student's frustration, the advisee showed him a different approach which surprised the teacher. This feat was achieved because of the critical thinking skill inculcated while attempting to find solutions to mathematical problems using the various strategies of the advisor. This problem solving skill has been helpful in solving personal and group conflicts. The advisee confessed that this skill has been employed during supermarket and other business errands.

A third year reported that during the first and second years, much difficulty was experienced writing a simple application letter. The advisee credited academic advising for instilling good communication skills. Likewise, a fourth year reminisced the challenges with communication during the former years but with the advisor's input, communication improved significantly. Both advisees have transferred these skills to sports activities, community meetings and other civic engagements.

An advisor reported that from observations, advisees' level of professional responsibility and social interactions with peers and faculty improved over time.

Summary of findings

The information collected from advisors and advisees were categorized into various themes. The most dominant and recurring themes were motivation, good/positive relationships, networking and critical thinking. This showed that all participants valued the relationships which were enabled through academic advising. Quite evidently, these relationships motivated or encouraged advisees to soar to the next level while thinking critically and managing their time effectively.

VI. IMPLICATIONS, RECOMMENDATIONS & CONCLUSION

IMPLICATIONS

The Ministry of Education, board chairmen, administrators, faculty, support staffs, students, alumni associations and community moguls need to foster meaningful partnerships with colleges to ensure that coaching/mentoring does not happen in isolation as this could thwart the good intentions of colleges. Community groups need to know that the yearly outputs by colleges do impact their organizations either positively or negatively depending on graduates' level of academic and social competence. These domino effects in turn affect productivity as incompetent graduates increase the attrition rate and training expenditure.

This study has contributed to the literature review by citing the gaps in social advising and the transferral of information to other areas of life which provides an opportunity for other researchers to do another study to address these issues. The findings of this study will provide significant evidence of the perception and value teachers-in-training have of academic advising. These will assist instructional leaders in higher institutions to get a better understanding of how to provide the relevant support to advisees and advisors who engage in academic advising.

RECOMMENDATIONS

The researcher analyzed the recommendations of all the participants and from the thick descriptive notes generated three categories also represented in the triangulation matrix: Table 1.1

Structured Academic Advising

1. College administrators need to establish and publish an academic advising policy where both advisors and advisees become aware of standards relating to accountability, frequency of advising, models/approaches to advising, types of advising, evaluation and non-compliance procedures, training and professional development for advisors, advisor/advisees ratio.
2. Create strong inter-departmental links where each department is equipped with the requisite information on academic advising to prevent misunderstandings.

Motivation

3. Remove the term 'academic advising' and replace with 'student advising' to broaden the scope to include financial management, emotional intelligence, spiritual awareness, social skills empowerment;
4. Create a gender-based design where males are assigned to males and females to females. The essence is to motivate students to attend the meetings as the male participants strongly believe females do not fully understand the testosterone issues. Below is a curt response from an advisee: **"Most of these students will not open up to adults unless they see you as a confident person, someone who they can trust with their lives. Someone who they can call on, without being bashed, someone who will talk to them on a social setting, someone who can help them to make the right decision as it relates to their personal and professional growth and development. As such, they may be falling by the way side and do not seek help because they are not comfortable with the persons they are assigned to. If they do not see their Advisers with at least a few of these character traits, then the intervention is just a name on a paper."**

5. Create a physical space for each lecturer to accommodate advising.

Commitment

6. Academic advising should operate on the premise of voluntarism as not all students are in need of this intervention (strong sentiment from both advisors and advisees). One advisor declared, **"...but not all students need academic advising, many of these students are mature and are able to figure out things for themselves, plus many are curious and tend to seek outside help"**.
7. Schedule professional forums for students and lecturers to share experiences and receive feedback.

CONCLUSION

Academic advising has been considered one of the best vehicles for promoting intellectual, personal and social development of students. It is a service that links students' academic and personal worlds, hence promotes holistic development. While the literature on academic advising focuses considerable attention on students' perceptions and satisfaction with advisors and faculty advisors' preferred styles of advising, much less is known about how students and faculty actually value the outcomes academic advising have on their social mobility and how they transfer these values to achieve meaning in the other areas of life.

This study was designed to identify the behaviors that occur during academic advising sessions between advisors and advisees at a public teacher training college and to compare these behaviors with students' cultural capital, advisor/advisee relationship, student satisfaction, models of advising and transferral of knowledge proposed in the literature. Students' perception and value of academic advising may improve overall advising practice; advisor training and evaluation. The literature provides insights on meaningful ways to approach advising that incorporate student satisfaction and the necessary characteristics of advising may simplify advising and help make evaluation and training of the advisors more efficient.

It is always vital to remember that effective academic advising occurs when advisors have regular contact with their advisees; gain meaningful insight into their advisees' academic, social and personal experiences and needs; and use that insight to help their advisees feel a part of the academic community, develop sound academic and career goals, and become successful learners (NACADA, 2004a).

REFERENCES

- Aldemir, C. & Gulcan, Y. (2004). Student satisfaction in higher education: A Turkish Case. *Higher Education Management and Policy*, 16 (2), 109-122.
- Baker, V. L. & Griffin, K. A. (2010). *Beyond mentoring and advising: Toward understanding the role of faculty "developers" in student success*. About Campus (January-February). Wiley InterScience (www.interscience.wiley.com): American College Personnel Association. DOI: 10.1002/abc.20002
- Brown, M.F.A. (2002). Advising Strategies: What Academic Advisers Can Learn from Sun Tzu. *The Mentor: An Academic Advising Journal*. Retrieved on April 3, 2008 from <http://www.psu.edu/dus/mentor/021021mb.htm>.

- Campbell, S.M. & Nutt, C.L. (2008). Academic Advising in the New Global Century: Supporting Student Engagement and Learning Outcomes Achievement. *peerReview. Association of American Colleges and Universities*. 10(1) 4-7.
- Cohen, A.M., & Kisker, C.B. (2010). *The shaping of American higher education: Emergence and growth of the contemporary system*. (2nd ed.). San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass.
- College Records (2014). Jamaica, West Indies
- Chickering, A.W, Gamson, Z.F., & American Association for Higher Education. (1987). Seven Principles for Good Practice in Undergraduate Education. *AAHE Bulletin*, 3-7
- Creamer, D.G. & Creamer, E.G. (1994). Practicing Developmental Advising: Theoretical contents and functional applications. *NACADA Journal*, 14 (2), 17-24.
- Creswell, J. W. (1998). *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design: Choosing Among the Five Traditions*. Sage Publications, Thousand Oaks, California.
- Creswell, J. W. & Miller, D.L. (2000). Determining validity in qualitative inquiry. *Theory into Practice*, 39 (3), 124-131.
- Creswell, J. W. (2003). *Research design: Qualitative, quantitative, and mixed methods Approaches* (2nd ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage
- Choate, L. & Granello, D. H. (2006). Promoting student cognitive development in counselor preparation: A proposed expanded role for faculty advisors. *Counselor Education and Supervision*, 46, 116-130
- Chun-Mei, Z. (2007) Academic advising—traditional or developmental approaches?: Students perspectives. *British Journal of Guidance & Counselling*, 24 (1)
- Crockett, D. S. (Ed.). (1978b). *Academic advising: A resource document*. Iowa City, IA: American College Testing Program. (ERIC Document Reproduction Service No. ED189906)
- Crockett, D. S. (1985). Academic advising. In L. Noel, R. Levitz, & D. Saluri (Eds.), *Increasing student retention* (pp. 224-263). San Francisco: Jossey-Bass, Retrieved October 10, 2010, from <http://www.scholar.lib.vt.edu/theses/public/etd-64712549711241/Thesis.pdf>
- Crockett, D. S. (Ed.). (1987). *Advising skills, techniques and resources: A compilation of materials related to the organization and delivery of advising services*. Iowa City, IA: American College Testing Program.
- Crookston, B.B. (1972). A developmental view of academic advising as teaching. *Journal of College Student Personnel*, 13(1), 12-17.
- Crookston, B.B. (1994). A Developmental View of Academic Advising as Teaching. *NACADA Journal*, 14(2), 5-9.
- Chun-mei, Z. (2007) Academic advising—traditional or developmental approaches?: Students perspectives. *British Journal of Guidance & Counselling*, 24 (1)
- Dillon, R. K., & Fisher, B. J. (2000). Faculty as part of the advising equation: An inquiry into faculty viewpoints on advising. *NACADA Journal*, 20(1), 16-23.
- Donnelly, J. E. (2006). *What matters to advisers: Exploring the current state of academic adviser job satisfaction*. Dissertation University of Cincinnati. Retrieved on December 16, 2008 from http://www.ohiolink.edu/etd/send-pdf.cgi/DONNELLY%20EDWIN.pdf?acc_num=ucin1141324536
- Epps, S. B. (2002). The Work Life of the Professional Academic Advisor: A Qualitative Study. *Dissertation Abstracts International*, 53 (2), 517.
- Evans, N. J., Forney, D. S., Guido, F. M., Patton, L. D., & Renn, K. A. (2010). *Student development in college: Theory, research, and practice* (2nd ed.). San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass.
- Frost, S. H. (1991). *Academic advising for student success: A system of shared-responsibility*. ASHE-ERIC Higher Education Report No. 3. Washington, D.C.: The George Washington University, School of Education and Human Development.
- Frost, S. H. (1993). Developmental advising: Practices and attitudes of faculty advisors. *NACADA Journal*, 13(2), 15-19.
- Glaser, B.G., & Strauss, A.L. (1967). *The discovery of grounded theory: strategies for qualitative research*. Hawthorne, N.Y.: Aldine de Gruyter.
- Glennen, R. E. (1995). *Academic advising as a comprehensive campus process*. NACADA Monograph Series (No. 2). Manhattan, KS: National Academic Advising Association
- Gordon, V. N., & Habley, W. R. (Eds.). (2000). *Academic advising: A comprehensive handbook*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass
- Habley, W. R., & McClanahan, R. (2004). *What works in student retention?* Iowa City, IA: American College Testing Program. (ERIC Document Reproduction Service No. ED500455)
- Hale, M., Graham, D., & Johnson, D. (2009). Are students more satisfied with academic advising when there is congruence between current and preferred advising styles? *College Student Journal*, 43(2), 313-324.
- Hamner, W. C., Organ, W. D. (1978). *Organizational Behaviour*, Business Publications, Texas.
- Harrison, E. (2009). Faculty perceptions of academic advising. *Nursing Education Perspectives*, 30(4), 229.
- Hollis, L. P. (2009). Academic advising in the wonderland of college for developmental students. *College Student Journal*, 43 (1), 5p
- Hossler, D., & Bean, J.P. (Eds.). (1990). *The strategic management of college enrollments*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.
- Hunter, M.S. & White, E.R. (2004). Could Fixing Academic Advising Fix Higher Education? *About Campus*, 9(1), 20-25.
- J. C., Twale, D. J., & Stein, E. L. (2001). *Socialization of graduate and professional students in higher education: A perilous passage?* (ASHE-ERIC Higher Education Report No. 3). Washington, DC: Association for the Study of Higher Education
- Jordan, P. (2000). Advising college students in the 21st century. *NACADA Journal*, 20(2), 21-30.
- Lichtman, M. (2010). *Qualitative research in education: A user's guide* (2nd ed). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Luna, G., & Cullen, D. L. (1998). Do graduate students need mentoring? *College Student Journal*, 32, 322-330.

- Malley, J. (1998). *The Measurement and Meaning of Student Satisfaction in the VET Sector: Melbourne*: ACER. Markham, S.J. A. Retrieved September 16, 2010 from http://www.csse.monash.edu.au/~smarkham/.../satisfaction_2203.htm
- Marques, J. F. (2005). Best practices in adult advising: A team conclusion. *Recruitment & Retention in Higher Education*, 19 (8), 4-5.
- Merriam, S. B. (2009). *Qualitative research: A guide to design and implementation*. San Francisco, CA: Jossey Bass.
- Moustakas, C (1994). *Phenomenological research methods*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage
- Murrill, T. A. (2005). Academic Advisor Job Satisfaction: Implications for Student Satisfaction. Unpublished dissertation
- National Academic Advising Association (2004b). *NACADA research agenda*. Retrieved January 10, 2014 from Http://www.nacada.ksu.edu/Clearinghouse/Research_Related/researchagenda.htm
- Noel, L, Levitz, R., & Saluri, D. (Eds) (1985). *Increasing student retention*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.
- O'Banion, T. (1994). An Academic Advising Model. *NACADA Journal*, 14(2), 10 - 16.
- O'Connell, K. (2010). *Valuing & Rewarding Academic Advising*. Fort Wayne: Indiana University.
- Pamela (2009) Published in The Mentor on December 2, 2009, by Penn State's Division of Undergraduate Studies, Available online at dus.psu.edu/mentor.
- Pascarelli, E., Terenzini, P. (1991). *How college affects students*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.
- Pascarella, E. T., & Terenzini, P. T. (2005). *How college affects students: Vol. 2. A third decade of research*. San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass.
- Petress, K. (1996). The multiple roles of an undergraduate's academic advisor. *Education*, 117(1), 90-91
- Pizzolato, J. E. (2006). Complex Partnerships: Self-authorship and Provocative Academic-Advising Practices. *NACADA Journal*, 26(1) p. 32-45.
- Raskin, M. (1979). Critical issue: Faculty advising. *Peabody Journal of Education*, (2), 99-108.
- Raushi, T.M. (1993). Developmental Academic Advising. In King, M.C. (Ed.) *Academic Advising: Organizing and Delivering Services for Student Success*. New Directions for Community Colleges, 82, 5-19.
- Saldana, J. (2013). *The coding manual for qualitative researchers*, (2nd ed). Los Angeles, CA: Sage
- Sahlberg, Pasi (2012) Published in The New York Times in 2012
- Schlosser, L. Z., & Gelso, C. J. (2001). Measuring the working alliance in advisor-advisee relationships in graduate school. *Journal of Counseling Psychology*, 48, 157-167.
- Schreiner, L.A., & Anderson, E. (2005). Strengths-based advising: A new lens for higher education. *NACADA Journal*, 25(2), 20-29.
- Smith, J. S. (Inpress). Implementing outcomes assessment in an academic affairs support unit. *Research in Higher Education*
- Stake, R. E. (1995). *The art of case study research*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Stein, G. B., Spille, H. A. (1974). Academic advising reaches out. *Personnel and Guidance Journal*, 53(1), 60-64.
- Tinto, V (1993). *Increasing student retention*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.
- Titley, R.W. & Titley, B.S. (1982). Academic Advising: The Neglected Dimension in Designs for Undergraduate Education. *Teaching of Psychology* 9, 45-49.
- Tuttle, K.N. (2000). Academic Advising. *New Directions for Higher Education*, 11, 15-24.
- Vision 2030 Jamaica - National Development Plan, the Medium Term Socio-Economic Policy Framework (MTF) 2009-2012
- Weidman, J. C., Twale, D. J., & Stein, E. L. (2001). *Socialization of graduate and professional students in higher education: A perilous passage?* (ASHE-ERIC Higher Education Report No. 3). Washington, DC: Association for the Study of Higher Education.
- Winston, R., Miller, T., Ender, S., Grites, T. & Assoc. (1984). *Developmental Academic Advising*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass, Inc.
- Yin, R. K. (2014). *Case Study Research. Design and Methods* (5thed). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

PERSONAL PROFILE

Joan Llewellyn is a final year doctoral student at Temple University and Director of Research, Development & Projects at Bethlehem Moravian College, Jamaica, West Indies.